

Appendices to Report on “A Proposal for Divestment”

Submitted to the Board of Trustees, Williams College

by

The Advisory Committee on Shareholder Responsibility

April 15, 2015

Contents:

1.A Proposal for Divestment

2. Results of Student Referendum

3.Letter from Faculty and Staff

**4. Response to Query regarding Fossil-Fuel-Free Investment Alternatives,
from Williams Endowment Initiative**

APPENDIX 1

A Proposal for Divestment

A proposal to the Williams College Board of Trustees and the Advisory Committee on Shareholder Responsibility recommending divesting the endowment of the 200 companies with the largest fossil fuel holdings.

Submitted on Behalf of Alumni, Students, Faculty, and Staff by the Williams Endowment Initiative and Divest Williams.

Contact

Daniel Shearer • drshearer@gmail.com • 802.338.7341

Dear President Falk and Trustees of Williams College

This proposal outlines an argument for Williams College to divest the endowment of the world's largest, publicly traded fossil fuel companies. We offer this proposal because it is one of the strongest actions that Williams can take to affect the national and international climate conversation, helping to remove the social license for the most climate-damaging activities. We also offer this proposal because it helps Williams reach higher and farther toward our institutional aspirations. This is a proposal for how we can deepen our commitment to the intersection of academic and civic virtues and how we can lead from the front among our institutional peers.

Our planet's rapidly changing climate is the most urgent and complex issue of our time. It is, perhaps, the most urgent and complex issue that humankind has ever faced. And yet, startlingly, we find ourselves devoid of effective leadership. National and international policy proposals lag far behind the goals set by the international community, the political process itself seems to impede any reasonable debate, and many individuals are left believing that the only actions they can take are to shop differently or unplug electronics. In short, progress is elusive, pessimism is high, and the sense of civic responsibility has been hollowed out.

It is time to define a new path forward. A crisis of this scale demands attention and action. It demands that we revitalize civic responsibility, recommit ourselves to meaningful action, and expand our horizon from the narrow confines of our homes to all of the communities and institutions to which we are bound. A political and ecological crisis of this scale demands the leadership that the Williams community can offer.

Williams has been an environmental leader. We have invested in green buildings, waste reduction, and efficient energy generation. We have made recycling and composting habitual and found ways to support local farms and local food systems. And today's Ephs are learning how to tackle important environmental challenges. This conservation work is an important and responsible way to partially address our individual footprints. We need more of it, but it will not deliver rapid change. This educational work is important and necessary, training leaders to grapple with the many challenges we will face related to climate disruption. We hope climate issues will be more deeply integrated across departments, but that also will not generate the level of change we need, as soon as we need it.

Meaningful action on climate will also require policy changes, and to achieve those we need a new, serious conversation about climate action. When

leading institutions commit to divestment, they help craft that conversation by signaling that it is time to move toward a way of life that is not reliant on burning a severely disruptive level of fossil fuels. It is time for Williams to add its voice to this conversation, declaring that we are no longer willing to betray future generations and far-off populations for our own short-term interests.

Over 500 members of the Williams community (alumni, students, faculty, and staff) request that you take this action and more are joining every week as they learn about the petition. The alumni come from every decade from the 50's to the present, and more join every week. And we can say with both sincerity and good humor that we are not just a group of reactionary, tree-hugging extremists. This proposal is coming to you from economists, lawyers, scientists, academics, artists, elected leaders, former oil industry workers, and executives. We are your peers. We are your community. And we are your constituents, committed members of the community that has been placed in your care.

President Falk, when we first approached you about this topic, you asked us to win the argument about divestment. Not to agitate, aggravate, or fight the college, but to complete a thorough investigation and make the case that divestment is a necessary and viable action for Williams College. We believe that we make that case and we are proud to present it.

Members of the Board, we look forward to discussing this proposal with you. If you find errors in our logic, we are ready to help explain or rectify them. If you have an alternate proposal that offers equal or better leadership and action on this issue, we are excited to hear about it so that we might support you and the college in pursuing it.

We want to be clear about one thing, though. While the action of divestment involves finances, this is far more than a financial decision. Rather, this is a policy decision, a statement of the College's stance regarding the most significant challenge of our time and of the College's willingness to assume the responsibilities of leadership.

We trust that the Advisory Committee on Shareholder Responsibility, the Office of the President, and the Board of Trustees will thoroughly consider this proposal. As this is an urgent matter, however, we request that the Board make a decision about divestment at your April meeting.

We are proud that Williams can consider this opportunity and we ask for your leadership now. Thank you.

WHEREAS

There is a strong scientific case that prompt and far-reaching changes in the fossil fuel industry are necessary to limit the most damaging effects of climate change.

CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING

- There is a broad consensus among physical, natural, and social scientists that human-caused climate change will have major ecological, social, political and economic effects, at speeds and scales that are unprecedented and likely beyond the adaptive capacity of many organisms, ecosystems, human communities, and nation-states.
- A vast scientific literature, including reports from the U.N. Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change and many branches of the U.S. government, including the Department of Defense, has found that human-caused climate change threatens the lives and livelihoods of people around the world, both directly (through effects on coastal, low-lying, and Arctic communities) and indirectly (through effects on agriculture, water supplies, fisheries, ocean acidification and declines in the phytoplankton populations crucial to marine food webs and oxygen production, public health and the spread of infectious diseases, and global political instability and U.S. national security, among others).
- Scientists have identified our fossil fuel-based economy as the primary contributor to human-caused climate change, accounting for approximately 60 percent of global greenhouse gas emissions.
- Scientists estimate that meeting the internationally agreed upon goal of less than 2°C of global warming will require that we burn less than 20 percent of proven fossil fuel reserves.
- Political scientists have further shown that major fossil fuel companies and affiliated institutions are willfully and systematically undermining the national and international political processes through which we might otherwise address climate change, by funding politicians who block actions to reduce fossil fuel use, by spreading misinformation, and by interfering with the reasonable use of scientific knowledge in policy processes.

AND;

WHEREAS

Human-caused climate changes and the resulting cascade of irreversible social and ecological consequences demand a new level of moral and ethical responsibility, particularly because of their rapidity, broad geographic scope, and significant intergenerational effects.

CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING

- The Earth is the *sine qua non* of human life, human society, and economy. Our deepest obligation to humans and to all species is to refrain from disrupting the natural systems that sustain life.
- The pursuit of a just and environmentally sustainable society imposes upon the privileged a special obligation to support the wellbeing of those who are currently most marginalized, most exploited, and most economically and ecologically vulnerable. Applying this ethical mandate to the contemporary climate challenge suggests that elite institutions of the global North, which have benefitted enormously from a fossil fuel-based economy, often at the expense of vulnerable peoples, have a moral obligation to shield those of lesser means from the negative consequences of the fossil fuel-based economy.
- Applying this ethical mandate inter-generationally suggests that our generation is duty bound to ensure a viable future for our children and grandchildren, who will bear inordinate costs as a result of our decisions. The type of world we leave to the College's future students and alumni, and indeed to our future societies more generally, depends on our courage to make the right decisions today.
- Recognizing these ethical obligations, the College has made efforts to reduce the climate emissions of campus operations and integrate climate issues into the curriculum, but has continued to finance and profit from climate-disrupting businesses. Fulfilling our moral and ethical obligations requires that we take meaningful climate action across all College activities, from operations and education to College finances.

AND;

WHEREAS

Investing in businesses that disrupt the global climate, cause negative social and ecological effects, spread distrust of legitimate science, and undermine democratic political processes, contradicts the mission and purposes of the College, as defined by this Board of Trustees on April 14, 2007.

CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING

- The Trustees have set for the College a noble goal of “providing the finest possible liberal arts education” so that students may comprehend and address the complex challenges of the future. This liberal arts education is meant to nurture “academic and civic virtues, and their related traits of character,” including critical thinking, informed public engagement, commitment to community, and intellectual honesty. Indeed, this education is intrinsically a moral enterprise. By financing and profiting from climate-disrupting fossil fuel companies, the College is teaching students that such academic and civic virtues are, in fact, secondary to economic profits.
- The Trustees “place great emphasis on learning that takes place in the creation of a functioning community,” including “direct engagement with human needs, nearby and far away,” and they encourage the College itself to embrace core values such as “ensuring that College operations are environmentally sustainable.”
- The Trustees recognize that the privilege enjoyed by Williams students “should not be regarded as a privilege destined to create further privilege, but as a privilege that creates opportunities to serve society at large, and imposes the responsibility to do so.” The College’s efforts to create opportunities to serve society at large, and its work to cultivate students capable of such a task, should not be financed by a system that harms society at large. This tradeoff contradicts the College’s mission, it is not necessary in order to support a high quality and broadly accessible Williams education, and it is unethical.

AND;

WHEREAS

Accomplishing the College's mission and fulfilling its responsibilities to alumni, faculty, staff, current and future students requires a new perspective on the stewardship of resources appropriate to the moral, economic, social, and ecological challenges of our time.

CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING

- The responsible stewardship of resources necessarily takes on new dimensions in the age of rapid and widespread climate disruption. In addition to the moral challenge, our fiduciary responsibility includes weighing the short-term economic value of climate-disrupting fossil-fuel investments against the long-term economic, social, and environmental costs of financing fossil fuel exploration and exploitation. As a broad range of economic advisors have noted, including former SEC Chairman Bevis Longstreth, the standard of "reasonable care" that inheres in fiduciary responsibility "leads easily to the conclusion that divestment of fossil fuel companies on the basis of the financial considerations... is a permissible option." Considering case law, Longstreth further argues that "it is entirely plausible, even predictable, that continuing to hold equities in fossil fuel companies will be ruled negligence" in the future.
- Responsible stewardship of resources in the current era also requires the recognition that all economic investments are also moral and political statements. Investment advisors at Williams and our peer institutions, when confronted with demands for divestment, have repeatedly emphasized that their job is to manage finances, not engage in politics. Such arguments ignore the fact that investing is never simply an economic decision. It is always moral, political, social, and ecological as well. By putting its resources behind climate-disrupting fossil fuel industries, Williams College is already making a political statement that we condone the social and ecological costs of the fossil fuel industry, that these are tolerable or necessary trade-offs, and that we are willing to shunt off the negative consequences of a fossil fuel-based economy to future generations and to especially vulnerable populations. The question at hand is therefore not whether the College should take a political stance through its investments, but rather what political stance the Board of Trustees sees as representative of the College's values.
- Taking these two arguments about fiduciary responsibility into account means that the College's current activities to address climate change via operations and the curriculum, while necessary, are insufficient alone.

AND;

WHEREAS

The investment community increasingly recognizes that the risk-reward profile of fossil free portfolios is reasonable and that potential costs may be more than compensated for by reductions in risk exposure and well-considered reinvestment.

CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING

- Investments in fossil fuel-intensive sectors face increasing and poorly understood risks. In addition to governments considering carbon taxes, cap-and-trade systems, and other regulations, companies are exploring for fossil fuels in riskier areas, increasing the likelihood of accidents with massive cleanup costs and fines.
- More importantly from a broader economic perspective, the most comprehensive study of the economics of climate change estimates that sustained economic growth requires that global emissions be reduced by no more than 3-4 percent annually. The longer we wait to initiate emissions reductions, the steeper those reductions will need to be. Failure to act now, across a wide range of fronts, therefore threatens global economic growth and the College's long-term investment outlook.
- As the divestment movement grows and the risks of fossil fuel exploitation and carbon regulation become more visible, prominent fund managers are offering an increasing number of fossil free investment vehicles.

AND;

WHEREAS

There is a tradition of the College using investments to advance non-economic goals central to its mission and values.

CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING

- The Advisory Committee on Shareholder Responsibility was established to guide the Trustees in socially responsible investment decisions and proxy votes.
- The College committed to avoid investments in firms doing business in Sudan.
- The College invested in Berkshire Capital Investments and adopted the Williams Social Choice fund to support economic development for the Berkshire region.

AND;

WHEREAS

Divestment of fossil fuel companies is one of the most powerful steps that the College can take to affect the national and international climate conversation, helping to remove the social license for the most climate-damaging activities.

CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING

- Business and management research shows that traditional forms of shareholder advocacy, such as proxy voting, are effective strategies for influencing corporate governance and diversity but have almost no impact on business operations, business models, and asset management. Meaningful action on climate change requires significant changes to the operations of fossil fuel industries and their management of proven fossil fuel reserves. There is no reason to believe that this will be achieved absent enormous public pressure and political action.
- For this reason, and in order to be consistent with their own missions and values, other prominent institutions are joining the movement to divest, including fourteen colleges and universities, thirty-four cities (ten of which are in Massachusetts), two counties, sixty-five religious institutions, and thirty-seven foundations and other institutions.
- The movement for fossil fuel divestment has already proven that it is an effective strategy for shifting public discourse on climate action and for generating enough social pressure to prompt real changes. For example, the CEO of NRG cited the divestment movement and its effects on future generations of consumers as a key impetus for NRG's decision to reduce CO2 emissions 90 percent by 2050. Similarly, observers at the recent UN Climate Change Conference in Lima, Peru, noted that the divestment movement helped create space for international negotiators and civil society representatives to discuss more far-reaching climate policies. Colleges and universities are thought leaders. Divesting shows that we take that responsibility seriously, in both our words and our actions. And when we divest, we create opportunities for citizens, consumers, businesses, and politicians to have serious discussions about climate change and to enact the broader policy changes that are necessary and urgent.

We therefore request that the President of the College and the Board of Trustees commit to the following:

- Williams College will make no new direct investments in the two hundred companies with the largest carbon reserves, and will direct external fund managers to do the same, effective immediately;
- Williams College will terminate relationships with those fund managers who cannot or will not honor this request, and will terminate said relationships in a reasonable time period and no later than three years from approval of this petition;
- Williams College will sell all direct and third-party-managed investments in the two hundred companies with the largest carbon reserves by January 1, 2020, at the latest; and
- Williams College will publish information about this divestment process, including any internal studies of divestment options, so that other institutions may benefit from the College's experience.

RESPECTFULLY,

Larry Daloz '62

Steve Kaagan '65, '84 (honorary degree)

Sarah Thorne '79

Mike McGinn '82

Brian Burke '02

Jordan Goldwarg '03

Mark Orlowski '04

Daniel Shearer '04

Mike Henry '04

Jen Lazar '04

Morgan Goodwin '08

Sophie Robinson '11

Miles Horton '15

Tara Miller '15

Sarah Vukelich '15

Erica Chang '18

Sohum Patnaik '18

ON BEHALF OF THE 500+ MEMBERS OF THE WILLIAMS COLLEGE COMMUNITY WHO HAVE PETITIONED FOR THESE REQUESTS. MORE ARE SIGNING ON EACH WEEK. SEE THE LATEST AT: WILLIAMSENDOWMENT.ORG.

Brandon Abasolo '13	Nicholas Borja '04	Clive Connor '75
Stephen Abbott '07	Meagan Bossong '05	Ellen Cook '00
Isy Abraham-Raveson	Melissa Bota '07	Mea Cook, Asst Professor
Abigail Adams '14	Kathleen Brantley '15	Hope Coolidge '75
Jacob Addelson '14	Rachel Brodie '02	Michelle Coombs '94
Funmi Adejobi	Evan Brodie '64	Robert Cooper '06
Justin Adkins	Kenneth Brown '05	Miranda Cooper '16
Kayla Agar '10	Stephanie Brown '89	Claudia Corona '13
Elizabeth Albert '14	Sara Brownrigg	Tyler Corson-Rikert '06
Laylah Ali '91	Derek Bruneau '94	Cody Cotner '15
James Altman '77	Caroline Bruno '15	Sarah Cottrill '15
Rebecca Anderson '00	Caitlin Buckley	Gordon Crabtree '08
Meredith Annex '11	Brian Burke '02	Janet Curran '02
Amelia Archer	Andrea Burke '06	Zara Currimjee '13
Suzanne Armstrong '04	Sam Burrington	Colin Curzi '12
Sam Arons '04	J.C. Calderon '87	Corie D '15
Henry Art	Jessica Caley Rice '98	Larry Daloz '62
Caroline Atwood	Talia Calnek-Sugin '15	Cecilia Davis-Hayes '11
Matt Atwood '01	Oscar Calzada '12	Edie De Niro
Lillian Audette '15	Elizabeth Campbell '09	Anne Debevoise '98
Eduardo Avalos	Shannon Campbell '14	Evelyn Denham '12
Nancy Baker Cahill '92	Gina Campoli '77	Manami Diaz Tsuzuki '18
Adam Banasiak '80	Annemarie Cancienne '98	Alex Dickinson
Emily Banner '96	Josh Cantor '08	Katherine Dieber '07
Rachel Barenblat '96	Caitlin Canty '04	Cesar Dominguez
Alicia Barrett '09	Nicolette Caravelli	Kate Dreher '99
Alyson Barrett '15	Isabelle Carr	Michael Druker '17
Gordon Bauer '14	Jennifer Cartee '97	Michael Drzyzga '10
Matthew Baya	Alejandra Castaneda	Ryan Dunfee '08
Cary Bearn '08	Jorge Castro	Rebecca Dunwoody
Alice Bearn '11	Selena Castro	Denise Duquette '09
Ellen Bearn '78	Laura Cavin Bailey '05	Stephanie Durell '14
Jennifer Bees '08	Rooney Charest '11	Rebecca Durst
Abigale Belcrest '16	Mallory Chen	Meghan Dwyer '06
Rebecca Bell	Kelly Chen '17	Candice Dyce
Viviana Benjumea '13	Laura Christianson '11	Lauren E. Finn '09
Claire Bergey	Corbin Chu '15	Ryan Eagan '15
Lucy Bergwall '16	Olivia Clark	Anita Earls '81
Magnus Bernhardsson	John Clayton '85	Lucas Elek '17
Ria Berns '04	Peter Clement '14	Kimberly Elicker '09
Brett Bidstrup	Rick Cohen	Clair Embry '11
John Bihn '16	Eirann Cohen '15	Nika Engberg '06
Emily Bloomenthal '05	Nicholas Colella '09	Kristin Engelbrecht-Bleem '04
Molly Bodurtha	Meghan Collins	Chase Epstein '17
Erica Bollerud '98	Kai Collins '98	J.M. Eros '04
Kalila Booker-Cassano '14	Katherine Conaway '09	Arantza Eseverri '15

Christina Fanciullo '09
Matilda Feder '13
Chloe Feldman Emison '12
Blake Ferger '95
George Ferger, Secretary,
Graduate Art History
Noemi Fernandez '09
Trillia Fidei-Bagwell '12
Crosby Fish '10
Alberto Flores
Emily Flynn '09
Zoe Fonseca '08
Katherine Foo '02
Caitlin Foster '14
Christopher Fox '11
Naomi Francois
Aaron Freedman '12
Elijah Fromm '17
Daniel Gainey
Katy Ganino Reddick '96
Paul Garofalo '13
Christopher Garvin '03
Gabrielle Gauthier
Biniam Gebre '00
Samir Ghosh '13
Alexis Gilman '96
Meg Giuliano '05
Liz Gleason '08
Kirsten Gleeson (Froburg) '90
Jordan Goldwarg '03
Taylor Goller '10
Eban Goodstein '82
Morgan Goodwin '08
James Goodwin '71
Matthew Goss
Omar Gouda
Vera Gould '14
Katie Grace '09
Ethan Gracer '14
Alexandra Grashkina-Hristov
'04
Ahmad Greene-Hayes '16
Alexei Greig '03
Quinn Griffin '15
Zoe Grueskin '14
Miaoru Guan '17

Wilfred Guerron
Michael Hagerty '08
Robert Hahn '05
Mariam Hale '14
Timothy Hanes '91
Miranda Hanson
Joseph Hardy '66
Merritt Harlan '16
Betsy Harper '79
Krista Harrison '04
Zoe Harvan
Zehra Hassan '12
Leslie Henslee '94
Nicholas Hiza '02
Hnin Hnin '10
Ron Hodges '80
Rachael Holmes '03
Megan Holmes '11
Paul Holt '02
Neal Holtschulte '06
Miles Horton '15
Justin Houk '98
Stephanie Hsiung '08
Kirsten Hudson '91
Jamie Hunt '03
Kristin Hunter-Thomson '03
Oscar Hurtado
Allegra Hyde '10
Ame Igharo '02
Mary Ignatiadis '16
Allan Isaac '91
Julia Isaacs '82
Katherine iverson '90
Sara Jablonski '07
Ryan Jacoby '09
Luis Jaramillo
Laurel Jarombek '15
Teng Jian Khoo '09
Ale Jochum '09
Gabrielle Joffe '11
Amy Johns '98
Lauren Johnson '01
Noel Johnson '01
Liza Johnson '92, Professor
of Art
Stuart Jones '08

Cooper Jones '08
Sam Jones '58
Olivier Joseph
Tisha Joseph Holmes '04
Michael Kamida '08
Bo Kane
Keith Kantack '11
Liz Kaplan '04
Julia Karoly '99
Owen Kay
Kimberley Kemper Beal '03
Nora Kenworthy '04
Chaewon Kim
Matthew Kim '01
Will Kirby '66
John Kling '09
Sarah Klionsky '03
Sarah Knight '95
Pei-Ru Ko '09
Jason Kohn '08
Alison Koppe '07
Toni Kraeva '09
Rory Kramer '03
Nick Kraus '14
Rachel Krcmar '16
Kate Krolicki '95
Julia Kropp '08
David Kruger '14
Claire Lafave '12
Jordan LaMothe
Jordan Landers, '09
Susanna Lang '77
Sasha Langesfeld '17
Erica Lansberg '14
Martin Lawrence
Jennifer Lazar '04
Carol Leary
Bert Leatherman '00
Nicholas Lee '11
William Lee '11
Nicholas Lee '11
Kendall Leet-Otley
Whitney Leonard '08
Michael Levien '01
Amy Levine '14
Michaela Levine '16

Jesse Levitt '08	Anthony Molina '09	Maggie Potter '04
Rachel Levy '09	Julio Monge	Tatyana Pramatarova '09
Samuel Lewis '15	Wilmer Montesdeoca	Reid Pryzant '16
Patty Liao '09	Paula Moore Tabor '76	Shadman Rahman '16
Jilly Lim	Molly Moran '14	David Ramos '00
Gerald Lindo '04	Josh Morrison '16	Abigail Rampone
Jonathan Linen '66	Lauren Moscoe '07	Timothy Ransom '65
Carmen Linero '15	Christopher Mullen '85	Hannah Ratcliffe '09
Angela Liu '15	Malik Nashad Sharpe '14	Shazeen Rattansi
John Long '64	Cooper Nassery	Alexander Ratte '09
David Long '96	Mariama Ndiaye	Jeremy Redburn '03
Jessica Lovaas '06	Nicholas Nelson '03	Carolyn Reuman '06
Kelsey Loy	Jack Nelson '07	Mairead Reynolds '18
Jason Lucas '02	Michael Nixon	Mark Rigby '93
Caleb Lucy '11	Madeleine Nyhagen '10	Jose Rivera
Jessica Luning '14	Clare O'Brien '15	Emily Roach
Chris Lyons	William O'Brien, '94	Sophia Robert '18
Don MacKinnon '90	Bonnie O'Keefe '09	Mary Robert Carter
Sasha Macko '11	Annie O'Sullivan '07	Kate Roberts '04
Russell Maclin '17	Michael Obeiter '04	Sophie Robinson
Emily Maglio '04	Theresa Ong '09	Valerie Roche '92
Steven Maier '78	Allison Orsi '93	Lara Roche'-Sudar '14
David Maldonado '11	Rachel Outterson '04	Emily Rockett '10
Clare Malone '09	Christopher Owyang '16	Michael Rodriguez
Kira Marrero	Lucy Page '16	Roxana Rodriguez
Allegra Martin '99	Sam Park	Raquel Rodriguez '16
Sophie Mason '10	Kenneth Park	Teresa Rodriguez '95
Leslie Massad '80	Prasannan Parthasarathi '83	Susan Roe '90
James Mathenge '12	Christine Pash	Anne Rojas, '15
Tom Matthews '96	Naomi Patterson	Emily Ronald '99
Alice Maurice '90	Tim Patterson '04	William Roper '77
Gay Mayer '64	Susmita Paul '16	Pedro Roque '13
Doris Mbabu	Marcela Peacock	Meghan Rose Donnelly '11
Emma McAvoy	Collin Peck-Gray 2015	Kit Rosen
James A. McCarthy '11	Celeste Pepitone-Nahas	Shawn Rosenheim
Paige McClanahan '04	Daniel Pesquera '11	Ariana Ross
Maia McCormick '14	Wade Phenicie '14	Charles Rousseau '11
Mike McGinn '82	Molly Pickel '15	Jennifer Rowe '11
Olivia Meyerson '16	Sofie Pietrantonio	Allison Rowe '16
Kristen Milano '09	Jamie Pinnell Hebert '04	Richard Ruberto
Rose Miles	Malin Pinsky '03	Michelle Ruby '02
Hristo Milev '09	Tenaya (Plowman) Kolar '02	Emily Russell-Roy '06
Tara Miller '15	Brian Policard	Yasmin Ruvalcaba
Adrian Mitchell	Olivia Polk '16	Christopher Sabot '99
Andrew Mitchell '02	Michael Polson '17	Isabella Salmi
Nora Mitchell '10	Gemma Porras	Hanna Saltzman '12

Sophia Schmidt	Jordan Tacher '09	Mariah Widman '15
Peter Schneeberger '92	Apurva Tandon	Sophia Wilansky '16
Sy Schotz '10	Kate Tardiff	Enith Williams '83
Jeremiah Schuur '96	Caroline Taylor '04	Elizabeth Willmott '99
Andrea Sehl '76	Kimberley Taylor '08	Zinnia Wilson '05
Julia Sendor '08	Aaron Taylor '16	Rachel Winch '06
Christopher Sewell '05	Susanna Theroux '05	Matthew Winkler '04
Shabana Shahabuddin '06	Sarah Thompson	Laura Winston '75
Mara Shapero '11	Frank Thoms '60	Nicole Wise '12
Daniel Shearer '04	Sarah Thorne '79	Victoria Wolff Spies '04
Charles Sheils '17	Chie Togami '13	Janee Woods Weber '98
Julianne Shelby Shelby '06	Joshua Torres	Sharifa Wright '04
Linda Shin	Carrie Tribble '13	Sunmi Yang '08
Peter Shin '08	Hector Trujillo	Steven Yannacone
Adam Shoemaker '05	Cortney Tunis '04	Andy Yao
Joseph Shoer '06	Andrew Udell '16	Brent Yorgey '04
Leah Shoer '09	Travis Vachon '06	Joyia Yorgey '05
Larry Shoer '73	Iein Valdez '97	Mustafa Yorukoglu '14
Kayla Shore	Julia van Hoogstraten '11	An-Lo Yu '07
Lauren Shuffleton '12	Soophia Vargas '10	Tiffany Yu '12
Quinlan Sievers '09	Michael Veloso '98	Jeffrey Zeeman '97
Amelia Simmons '13	Vidya Venkatesh	Seth Zeren '05
Shanti Singham, Professor of Africana Studies & History	Michael Vercillo '14	Nancy Zhong
Lisa Sloan '09	Nathaniel Vilas	Ethan Zuckerman '93
Postyn Smith '15	Cameron Virrill '81	
Mia Smith '16	Tracey Vitchers '10	
Fiona Smythe '91	Phuong Vo '18	
Nitza Solis '14	Ragnar Von Schiber '90	
Stefanie Solum	Jacques Vroom '66	
Helen Song '14	Sarah Vukelich '16	
Thammika Songkaeo '11	Rachel Waldman '17	
Meredith Sopher '14	Jessica Walker '91	
Uygar Sozer '17	Hilary Walrod '01	
Laura Specker Sullivan '08	Mark Walrod '01	
Anna Spellman	Mac Walton '08	
Anna Spiers '15	Zina Ward '12	
Rebecca Staiger '09	Oona Watkins '15	
Alice Stears '15	Erin Weekley '06	
Katie Stevens '05	Russ Weis '78	
Robin Stewart '06	Garrett Welson '15	
Eve Streicker '09	Katherine White '11	
Caitlin Sullivan, '07, Artistic Director of the Williams College Summer Theatre Lab	Caroline White-Nockleby '16	
Mark Sutton '93	Richard Whitney '16	
Gaye Symington '76	Wendy Wiberg	
	Jim Wick '62	
	Alix Wicker	

APPENDIX 2

Williams College Divestment Student Referendum Results

On February 26-28, 2015, the student body voted on the following text:

“Do you agree that Williams College should divest its endowment from the 200 fossil fuel companies with the most carbon remaining in their reserves?”

The non-binding referendum required one-third of the student body to participate and two-thirds to vote “Yes” in order for the referendum to pass.

The results are as follows:

Voter participation: 62.02%

Yes: 946 (71.34%)

No: 380 (28.66%)

The referendum passed with 71.34% support from the student body.

APPENDIX 3

FINAL

April 6th, 2015

Dear President Falk and the Board of Trustees:

We, the undersigned faculty and staff, have been heartened in the last months to witness an energetic student and alumni movement to divest our college holdings from the 200 largest publicly-traded companies in the fossil fuel industry. Through a series of thoughtful and enlightening debates and conversations since last year, we have come to believe wholeheartedly in the efficacy, necessity, and urgency of this demand. We would like to offer our support to the student and alumni-led campaigns, as well as our own reasons for supporting divestment.

The faculty and staff, like the president and the board of trustees, are stewards of an endowment that has been given in trust to our college explicitly as an investment in our shared future. In our mission statement, we rightly ask our students “to understand that an education at Williams should not be regarded as a privilege destined to create further privilege, but as a privilege that creates opportunities to serve society at large, and imposes the responsibility to do so.” We must model such responsibility for our students, just as we must take seriously our own commitment of “ensuring that our college operations are sustainable”—a sustainability that includes operations of our budget, and thus, our investments.

As a respected institution of higher learning, we are in a position to have a voice in one of the most important public debates of our time. The most immediate, and perhaps most important, virtue of being at the forefront of divestment is to help shape this debate, and to demonstrate for our students the power of rhetoric and activism in all of its forms, both institutional and individual. We believe that we should convey to our students that knowledge and responsibility happen at Williams, as well as in other leading institutions. If we want to continue to attract the brightest and most forward thinking students, faculty, and staff from across the country and around the world, then leadership is not a luxury, but a necessity.

In the matter of climate change, the effects of which are already catastrophic, we are obligated to eschew the traditional risk-averseness of venerable institutions and act instead as leaders in the public sphere. In light of existing data, it is difficult to credit the arguments that we have heard against divestment, particularly those that pessimistically imagine a more certain financial outcome of divestment than can be predicted for any of our investments. Moreover, if we use accounting systems that include the externalities of damages caused to the planet and its economic systems, investments in fossil fuel companies are poor choices.

We must do what we can to address climate change in substantive ways, not least because we know already how immensely costly it is. As sharers in the stewardship of the college, our endowment managers ought to exercise not just caution, but also agility, vision, and a

keen sense of the future; it is indisputable that climate change itself, not just climate policy, will affect the economy. The US National Climate Assessment, the UN IPCC reports, and the Stern Review all detail significant economic changes generated by climate change, and a responsibly invested endowment will not only respond to, but also anticipate these changes. What's more, shifting our investments from fossil fuels to renewable energy will enable new technologies that will be essential to our energy future.

Written into the very core beliefs of our college is the understanding that "no one can pretend to more than guess at what students now entering college will be called upon to comprehend in the decades ahead." Yet we do know that climate change will be a defining challenge of their lives. Even as we are actively working to understand the magnitude and duration of change that we will experience, the actions we take today will impact not only the future of Williams and our immediate community, but of all species, including ours, and of our planet.

We find ourselves at a critical moment where we can make choices that will affect the quality and nature of what our lives will be like 50, 100, 1,000 years from now. The urgency of responding to climate change cannot be overstated. We join in partnership with our students, alumni, and other members of the Williams community in our commitment to changing the future we all now face. Because divestment has the proven capacity to shift public opinion and the terms of the current debate on climate change, we believe it is a crucial next step.

Signed,

Aida Laleian, Professor of Art
Alan de Gooyer, Lecturer in English
Alan White, Professor of Philosophy
Alex Engel, Assistant Professor of Biology
Alexandra Garbarini, Associate Professor of History
Alison Case, Professor of English
Alison Sachet, Visiting Assistant Professor of Psychology
Alison Swain, Assistant Professor of Physical Education and Head Coach of Women's Tennis
Amy Holzapfel, Associate Professor of Theatre
Amy McKenna, Assistant Visual Resources Curator
Amy Podmore, Professor of Art
Andrea Barrett, Senior Lecturer in English
Anita Sokolsky, Professor of English
Anjuli Raza Kolb, Assistant Professor of English
Anne Valk, Associate Director for Public Humanities
Annelle Curulla, Assistant Professor of French Literature and Language
Annette Joseph-Gabriel, Visiting Assistant Professor of French Language and Francophone Literature
Aparna Kapadia, Assistant Professor of History
Armando Vargas, Assistant Professor in the Program of Comparative Literature
Ashok Rai, Associate Professor of Economics
Audrey Werner, Technical Assistant, Biology Department
Barbara Takenaga, Professor of Art
Bernard Rhie, Associate Professor of English

Betty Zimmerberg, Professor of Neuroscience, Chair of Psychology
Beverly A. Williams, Director of Multicultural Outreach, Student Health Services
Bill Wagner, Professor of History, Chair of Leadership Studies Program
Bojana Mladenovic, Associate Professor of Philosophy
Brad Wells, Lecturer in Music, Director of Choral/Vocal Activities
Brian Martin, Associate Professor of French and Comparative Literature
Brian McCammack, Visiting Assistant Professor of Environmental Studies
Brianna Heggseth, Assistant Professor of Statistics
Bruce Wheat, Media Services Specialist
Bud Wobus, Professor of Geology
Candis Watts Smith, Assistant Professor of Political Science
Carmen Whalen, Professor of History, Chair of Latina/o Studies
Carol Stein-Payne, Nurse, Student Health Services
Cassandra Cleghorn, Senior Lecturer in English and American Studies
Catherine Newman Howe, Visiting Lecturer in Art
Cecilia Chang, Professor of Chinese
Cesar Silva, Professor of Mathematics
Charles B. Dew, Professor of American History
Charles Paquette, Visual Resources Technical Specialist
Cheryl Shanks, Professor of Political Science
Chip Lovett, Professor of Chemistry, Chair of Bioinformatics, Genomics and Proteomics Program
Chris Blackman, Catalog Librarian
Chris Waters, Professor of Modern European History
Christian Thorne, Associate Professor of English
Christina Olsen, Director of the Williams College Museum of Art
Christopher Pye, Professor of English
Christopher Taylor, Visiting Assistant Professor of English
Colin Adams, Professor of Mathematics
Dan Greenberg, Assistant Professor of Physical Education and Head Coach of Men's Tennis
Darra Goldstein, Professor of Russian
David Ackerson, Assistant Director of Outing Club
David C. Smith, Senior Lecturer in Biology
David Dethier, Professor of Geology and Mineralogy
David Edwards, Professor of Anthropology
David Eppel, Chair and Professor of Theatre
David Keiser-Clark, Academic Application Developer
David L. Smith, Professor of English
David Richardson, Professor of Chemistry
David Tucker-Smith, Associate Professor of Physics
Deborah Brothers, Lecturer in Theatre and Costume Director
Diane Hart, Senior Museum Registrar for Collections and Exhibitions
Dieter Bingemann, Professor of Chemistry
Don Clark, Utilities Program Manager
Donald Beaver, Professor of History of Science, Chair of Science and Technology Studies
Dorothy Wang, Associate Professor of American Studies and Faculty Affiliate in English
Doug Kiel, Assistant Professor of American Studies and Faculty Affiliate in History
Doug Paisley, Studio Art Assistant
Drew Jones, Hopkins Memorial Forest Manager
Ed Epping, Professor of Art
Ed Gollin, Associate Professor of Music
Elizabeth McGowan, Professor of Art

Enrique Peacock-Lopez, Professor of Chemistry
Erica Dankmeyer, Artist-in-Residence in Dance
Ferentz Lafargue, Director of the Davis Center
Frank Jackson, Visiting Lecturer in Art
Gage McWeeny, Associate Professor of English
Gail Newman, Professor of German
Gene Bell-Villada, Professor of Romance Languages
George Ferger, Secretary, Graduate Program in the History of Art
Gisela Demant, Technical Assistant, Chemistry Department
Gretchen Long, Associate Professor of History
Guy Hedreen, Professor of Art
Heather Williams, Professor of Biology, Chair of Neuroscience
Helga Druxes, Professor of German
Henry Art, Professor of Environmental Studies and Biology
Holly Edwards, Senior Lecturer in Art
Jacqueline Hidalgo, Assistant Professor of Latina/o Studies and Religion
James Manigault Bryant, Associate Professor of Africana Studies, Chair
Jana Sawicki, Professor of Philosophy
Jane Canova, Administrative Director of Center for Foreign Languages, Literatures and Cultures
Jane Nicholls, Director of Parents Fund
Janine Parker, Visiting Artist in Residence in Dance
Janneke van de Stadt, Professor of Russian
Jason Josephson, Associate Professor of Religion, Chair
Jay Racela, Technical Assistant, CES
Jeannie Albrecht, Associate Professor of Computer Science
Jeff Moher, Visiting Assistant Professor of Psychology
Jeff Strait, Professor of Physics
Jennifer Chuks, Assistant Professor of Physical Education & Assistant Athletic Director
Jennifer French, Professor of Spanish
Jessica Chapman, Associate Professor of History
Jessica Fisher, Assistant Professor of English
Jim Shepard, Professor of American History, Literature, and Eloquence
Jimmy Blair, Assistant Professor of Chemistry
Jinhwa Chang, Visiting Lecturer in Japanese
Joan Edwards, Professor of Biology
John Kleiner, Professor of English
John Limon, Professor of English, Chair
Jonathon Leamon, Director of Instructional Technology
Joy James, Professor of Humanities
Joyce Foster, Director of Academic Resources
Julie Cassiday, Chair of German and Russian and Professor of Russian
Justin Adkins, Assistant Director – Gender, Sexuality and Activism, Davis Center
Justin Crowe, Assistant Professor of Political Science
Karen Shepard, Senior Lecturer in English
Karen Swann, Associate Dean for Institutional Diversity, Professor of Rhetoric
Kashia Pieprzak, Associate Professor of Francophone Literature, French Language, and Comparative Literature
Kasumi Yamamoto, Professor of Japanese, Chair
Katie Kent, Professor of English
Keith McPartland, Associate Professor of Philosophy
Ken Savitsky, Professor of Psychology

Kenda Mutongi, Professor of History
Kenneth Kuttner, Professor of Economics
Kevin Escudero, Bolin Fellow in Latina/o Studies
Kim Gutschow, Lecturer in Religion
Kris Allen, Artist in Residence in Jazz Activities/Lecturer in Music
Krista Matatt, Teacher, Children's Center
Kristen Tool, Lead School Age Teacher, Children's Center
Larry Kaplan, Professor of Natural Sciences
Laura Ephraim, Assistant Professor of Political Science
Laura McKeon, Associate Dean and Dean of International Education
Laura Sockol, Visiting Assistant Professor of Psychology
Lauren Williamson, Visiting Assistant Professor of Psychology
Laurie Heatherington, Professor of Psychology
Lawrence Raab, Professor of Poetry
Laylah Ali, Professor of Art
Leslie Brown, Associate Professor of History
Li Yu, Associate Professor of Chinese
Linda Reynolds, Visual Resources Curator, Art Department
Lindley Wells, Education Outreach Consultant, Center for Learning in Action Office
Lisa Gilbert, Associate Professor of Geosciences and Marine Sciences
Liz Gallerani, Curator of Academic Programs, WCMA
Liza Johnson, Professor of Art
Lois Banta, Associate Professor of Biology
Luana Maroja, Assistant Professor of Biology
Lucie Schmidt, Professor of Economics, Chair of Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies
Lynn Chick, Fellowship Coordinator, Dean's Office
Magnus Bernhardsson, Professor of History
Marcela Peacock, Program Coordinator, Davis Center
Margaux Cowden, Visiting Assistant Professor of English
Maria Cruz, Dietician/Nutrition Educator
Maria Elena Cepeda, Associate Professor of Latina/o Studies and Faculty Affiliate in American Studies and Women's, Gender and Sexuality Studies
Mariko Moher, Assistant Professor of Psychology
Mark Hauxtausen, Professor of Art History
Mark Labonte, Snack Bar Night Supervisor, Dining Services
Mark Reinhardt, Professor of American Civilization, Chair of American Studies Program
Mary Ellen Czerniaki, Director of Corporate and Foundation Relations
Marybeth Mitts, Manager, Spouse Partner Resources
Mason Williams, Visiting Assistant Professor of Leadership Studies
Matt Carter, Assistant Professor of Biology
Matthew Baya, Networks and Systems Administrator
Maureen Strype, Nurse, Student Health Services
Maurita Poole, Mellon Curatorial Fellow for Diversity in the Arts
Mea Cook, Assistant Professor of Geosciences
Meg Bossong, Director of Sexual Assault Prevention and Response, Dean's Office
Meg Conan, Assistant Coach of Women's Crew
Megan Mazza, Studio Assistant, Art Department
Meghan McCormick, School Age Teacher, Children's Center
Meredith Hoppin, Professor of Classics
Merida M. Rua, Associate Professor Latina/o Studies and American Studies
Michael Evans, Assistant Director, Zilkha Center

Michelle Apotsos, Assistant Professor of Art
Mika Hirai, Instructional Technology Specialist, OIT
Mike Glier, Professor of Art
Molly Magavern, Director of Special Academic Programs
Molly Polk, Coordinator for the Center for Learning in Action, Williams Elementary Outreach
Morgan McGuire, Associate Professor of Computer Science
Natalie Bump Vena, Bolin Fellow in Anthropology and Environmental Studies
Nate Kornell, Assistant Professor of Psychology
Neil Roberts, Associate Professor of Africana Studies
Ngonidzashe Munemo, Associate Professor of Political Science, Chair of International Studies Program
Nicolas Howe, Assistant Professor of Environmental Studies
Nicole Mellow, Associate Professor of Political Science
Nimu Njoya, Assistant Professor of Political Science
Noah Sandstrom, Professor of Psychology
Olga Shevchenko, Chair and Associate Professor of Sociology
Patricia Acosta, Departmental Administrative Assistant, Geosciences
Patricia Malanga, Academic Assistant, English
Patti Exster, Coordinator, Corporate and Foundation Relations
Paul Gitterman, Psychotherapist, Student Health Services
Paul Park, Lecturer in English
Paula Consolini, Director of the Center for Learning in Action
Pete Farwell, Assistant Professor of Physical Education and Head Cross Country Coach
Peter Just, Professor of Anthropology, Chair of Interdisciplinary Studies Program
Peter Low, Professor of Art
Peter Murphy, Professor of English
Phoebe Cohen, Assistant Professor of Geosciences
Pia Kohler, Assistant Professor of Environmental Studies
Rachel Heisler, Program Coordinator, WCMA
Randal Fippinger, Producing Director, Theatre Department
Rebecca Ohm, Reference and Government Documents Librarian
Rebecca Taurog, Assistant Professor of Chemistry
Rhon Manigault-Bryant, Associate Professor of Africana Studies
Richard Lescarbeau, Video Assistant, Art Department
Rick Spalding, Chaplain to the College
Rob Savage, Professor of Biology
Roger Kittleson, Professor of History
Ronadh Cox, Chair and Professor of Geosciences, Chair of Maritime Studies Program
Saadia Yacoob, Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow in Religion
Sam Crane, Chair and Professor of Political Science
Sandra L. Burton, Director of Dance and Senior Lecturer in Dance, Chair
Sara Dubow, Associate Professor of History
Sarah Gardner, Associate Director, Lecturer in Environmental Studies
Scarlett Jang, Professor of Art History
Scott Lewis, Asst. Professor of Physical Education and Director of Outing Club
Scott Wong, Professor of History
Seulghee Lee, Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow in English
Shaila Seshia Galvin, Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow in Environmental Studies
Shana Shippee, Lead Preschool Teacher, Children's Center
Shanti Singham, Professor of History and Africana Studies
Shawn Rosenheim, Professor of English

Shelley Williamson, Assistant Director of Admission
Shinko Kagaya, Professor of Japanese
Sourena Parham, Language Media and Technology Specialist
Stacy D. Fahrenthold, Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow in Middle Eastern History
Stefanie Solum, Chair and Professor of Art
Stephen Tifft, Professor of English
Steven Gerrard, Professor of Philosophy
Steven Levin, Professor of Art
Susan Dunn, Professor in the Arts and Humanities
Susan Engel, Senior Lecturer in Psychology, Director of Program in Teaching
Taylor Bundy, Career Center, Office Assistant
Tendai Muparutsa, Lecturer in Music, Director of Zambezi, Co-Director of Kusika
Tracy Finnegan, Assistant Director, Regional and At-Risk Education, Center for Learning in Action
Trevor Murphy, Instructional Technology Specialist
VaNatta Ford, Visiting Assistant Professor of Africana Studies
Veronica Bosley, Commencement and Academic Events Assistant
Vivian Huang, Bolin Fellow in Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies and Comparative Literature
W. Anthony Sheppard, Chair and Professor of Music
Walter Johnston, Visiting Assistant Professor of English
Ward Lopes, Assistant Professor of Physics
William Darrow, Professor of Religion
William Wootters, Professor of Natural Philosophy
Zaid Adhami, Visiting Instructor in Religion
Zirka Filipczak, Professor of Art

Final total: 248 *

Faculty: 189 (55% of total faculty*)

Tenured and tenure track faculty: 147

Staff: 59

* Using "total number of instructional faculty" provided by Provost's office 2014-2015 Common Data Set, page 24.

APPENDIX 4

Dear Members of the ACSR,

In support of our Proposal to the Board of Trustees to divest from fossil fuels, we are responding to your request to elaborate on the following assertion:

“As the divestment movement grows and the risks of fossil fuel exploitation and carbon regulation become more visible, prominent fund managers are offering an increasing number of fossil free investment vehicles.”

We want to be clear at the outset that the Trustees, and your committee on their behalf, must wrestle with the difficult trade-offs among multiple considerations to arrive at what is best for the institution and its constituents. They should make a determination with the same thorough review and courage of conviction as in the past when Williams faced complex decisions with both moral and financial implications, such as banning fraternities or admitting women.

In making this response we understand that we are being asked to offer counsel and suggestions in the absence of full knowledge of past actions and rationales regarding investment decisions; we acknowledge the expertise of the Board’s Investment Committee and do not presume to supplant it.

Thanks for your request and we look forward to providing any further assistance we can. Best of luck in your deliberations to arrive at an effective strategy to address climate change.

Steve Kaagan, Larry Daloz, and Daniel Shearer, on behalf of the Williams Endowment Initiative

The Larger Context

An adequate response to your request requires that we set forth the larger context in which the decision to divest resides. We make the fundamental assumption that *financial decisions cannot be separated from their social and ecological context*. Any responsible consideration of the financial performance of endowment holdings is contingent on a number of other economic, historic, political, and moral considerations as well as the overall purpose of the divestment action itself. Past decisions to divest and consider proxy votes on social issues indicate that the Board of Trustees holds the same assumption and established the ACSR to advise on how to move forward in these cases.

At a time in history when human activity is undeniably changing the very conditions under which our species has evolved, we must recognize that a

primary question is *What constitutes right action on behalf of the long-term well-being of the planet and its inhabitants?* It is our assertion that a central purpose of fossil fuel divestment is to exert pressure on the fossil fuel industry by opening political opportunities for greater regulation and support of alternative energy sources, ultimately causing it to limit extraction and leave the carbon in the ground that we can't afford to burn. It is our conviction that this must be done for moral and political as well as economic reasons.

The Economic Argument

We are confident that removing investments from fossil fuel companies and investing in a diversity of funds, including initiatives that further the College's mission, will not increase risk or reduce revenue. The fossil fuel industry is not a large enough segment of available investments to restrict diversity and it has significant short term variability and long term risks, including balance sheets that rely on carbon assets that will be unrecoverable after effective regulation is passed.

Studies such as the Fischel Study [NYT 2/9/15] which claim that "oil divestiture may hurt college endowments" should be sharply questioned for accuracy, bias, and special interest. A study commissioned by the Petroleum Association of America, it addresses only oil (not coal or tar sands), and is based on past data, a methodology that is fatally flawed under present day conditions when the entire energy field is in dramatic flux and when climate science is significantly influencing the market. Furthermore, this study, and others reaching the same conclusion, assume that the holdings would be dropped all at once, when in fact, our recommendation, as well as that of 350.org, is that divestment be implemented over a period of five years.

We acknowledge that the primary reason peer institutions have cited for not taking action on divestment is a lack of alternatives to commingled funds. The demand for these fossil free funds is still new and the response is quickly evolving. Still, it will take time to build up a set of offerings that is comparable to the diversity of options currently available to the College. It is with this understanding that we encourage the Trustees to take time in divesting from these assets. In our research, we found both new offerings and a frequent suggestion that if there were more specific requests for these funds, then managers would work with their clients to provide them. Williams may not be a large enough investor to justify this creation, but from the feedback we received from fund managers and others in the industry, we are confident that collaboration with peer institutions, foundations, churches, and pension funds would present a large enough demand to create a diversity of options.

The investment office could provide great assistance in organizing such efforts. More specific current and potential opportunities are listed in the Opportunities section below.

The Moral and Political Arguments

While we have been given to understand that purely moral arguments will not prove persuasive to the ACSR, the President, or the Board of Trustees, we must point out that such arguments carry a powerful indirect influence on the markets and have very real and practical consequences.

There is no doubt, for instance, that sectors of the fossil fuel industry have spent enormous sums to deny the reality of climate change. When prestigious institutions—foundations, religious groups, universities, even insurance companies—withdraw support from these corporations, over time the preference will be evident to the public at large and affect political choices, leading to restrictions such as a carbon tax or other limits on extraction. Even the threat of withdrawing support affects the market.

Moreover, financial performance must also be weighed within the frame of minimal ethical standards within the body politic. Corporations producing fossil fuels have allocated enormous sums to undermine the very basis of democratic deliberation and decision-making. Institutions that can influence their behavior should withdraw support through whatever means available. There is strong precedent for taking account of such considerations, e.g., excluding investment in tobacco companies.

Finally, financial performance must be viewed from the perspective of cultural norms that under-gird continuing prosperity and ample opportunity for future generations, e.g., future Williams students. Continued reliance on fossil fuels undermines these norms such that their role in our economic system should be diminished and replaced as soon as possible.

Opportunities

Our research found current investment vehicles, opportunities in the process of being established, and the potential for creating opportunities through collaboration with other institutions. We still have some inquiries out and will

continue to forward on opportunities. It is evident that this is a time when new options are developing in response to over \$50 billion in committed divestment funds and that there is still room for a hand in shaping that development, a role where Williams could provide valuable leadership. Over the next five years, we expect that the concern of diversity will no longer be an issue as supply for fossil free funds meets the demand. But in order for that to happen, the demand must be made. We have no vested interests in any of these firms. We aim to back up our assertion that more fossil free investment vehicles are becoming available by both providing advisors who are assisting other institutions in their divestment process and by providing investment opportunities.

ADVISORS

There are several prominent asset management consultants who have stated their willingness to help clients remove investments from endeavors that contradict their mission and invest in opportunities that further their mission. Williams already has an investment office, but the expertise of these consultants and their engagement with other clients will enhance the focus on identifying new opportunities. Consultation can provide important learning from their work with a diverse client base.

- **Arbor Group at UBS** - purportedly the first assets management firm in North America associated with a major bank (UBS) to go fossil fuel free. They have shown that divestment/reinvestment can actually reduce risk and increase revenue. financialservicesinc.ubs.com/team/thearborgroup
- **Blackrock** - the world's largest fund manager, it has joined with the Natural Resources Defense Council and global index provider FTSE to offer a fossil fuel free index for investment. Their experience in identifying opportunities may provide good counsel. www.nrdc.org/media/2014/140429.asp
- **Cambridge Associates** - possibly the largest advisor and manager of endowments, including for Williams' peers such as Swarthmore. They have stated that they are ready to assist their clients in finding the best way to manage their funds to match their values, including divestment. www.cambridgeassociates.com/news/articles/cambridge-associates-perspective-on-the-ongoing-fossil-fuel-divestment-discussion

- **Grantham Foundation** – not an advisor, but can provide updates on their experience of committing to no new coal or tar sands investments and allocating 20% of their endowment to impact investments that they believe are competitive with the rest of their portfolio on a risk-adjusted basis. Most of the investments are real assets, venture capital, and private equity. Contact Ramsay Ravenel at rravenel@granthamfoundation.org.
- **Imprint Capital** – hired by Parella Weinberg Partners to assist with the Rockefeller Brothers Foundation investments, Imprint Capital identifies investment opportunities that further an institution's mission. www.imprintcap.com
- **Parella Weinberg Partners** – providing advisory and asset management services for \$10.8 billion in investments. They were hired by the Rockefeller Brothers Foundation to divest their portfolio from fossil fuels and invest in initiatives that further their mission. They anticipate their divestment process to take two to three years. www.pwpartners.com
- **SRI Wealth Management at RBC** - associated with the 5th largest banking institution in the U.S., this wealth management firm specializes in sustainable investing and consults widely with institutions seeking to move away from fossil fuel companies. www.Sriwealthmanagement.com

INVESTMENT FUNDS

Here are additional opportunities for consideration that may be suitable alternatives to current commingled fund investments. These opportunities will continue to grow with demand and may be created through collaboration with peers.

- **Generation Investment Management LLP** – a commingled fund with a minimum investment of \$3 million, dedicated to combining integrated sustainability research with long term investing: www.generationim.com
- **GMO** - managing over \$120 billion in assets, it predicts an overvaluation of carbon assets and manages funds to protect against that risk. They don't currently offer fossil free investment vehicles, but we were encouraged that if clients asked for them, they may be made available. www.gmo.com/America
- **New World Capital Group** – A private equity firm that could provide effective investment opportunities: www.newworldcapital.net

- **Tellus Mater** - a UK organization in the process of assembling large investors to essentially create a commingled fund. We've included the description of their intention in the attached PDF. They are interested in talking with Williams about investing, though their initial timeline is soon. This is an example of an initiative that Williams could learn from and also initiate with other peers. Contact Kelly Clark, Kelly@tellusmater.org.uk.
- **Trillium Asset Management** - offers two fossil free funds and reduces the fee schedule at higher investment levels from 1% at \$2 million to 0.4% at greater than \$50 million, with stages in-between. Other well established socially responsible investment funds offer fossil free funds and may be willing to create commingled class investments or equivalent if the right collaboration of institutions made the request. www.trilliuminvest.com
- **Zevin Asset Management Group** - smaller scale operation; does not manage commingled funds, but its institutional, separately managed account service allows much more flexibility than a commingled fund. Contact Sonia Koval at www.zevin.com.